

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
OFFICIAL MINUTES  
OCTOBER 3, 2012**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

**PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**ABSENT: Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Rodriguez, Zuniga**

- Chairman's Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- |                      |                        |
|----------------------|------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2012-276 | 123 Losoya             |
| 2. Case No. 2012-216 | 430 E. Commerce        |
| 3. Case No. 2012-273 | 117 W. Gramercy Pl.    |
| 4. Case No. 2012-275 | 230 Mary Louise        |
| 5. Case No. 2012-272 | 511 Mason              |
| 6. Case No. 2012-277 | 405 E. Rosewood        |
| 7. Case No. 2012-271 | 349 Mary Louise        |
| 8. Case No. 2012-267 | 1408 N. St. Mary's St. |

Commissioner Guarino pulled item 7 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**7. HDRC NO. 2012-271**

Applicant: Jack Leifer and Carr Hornbuckle

Address: 349 Mary Louise

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a rolling wrought-iron enclosure gate along the front of the carport. The enclosure will be 7' tall and will extend about 1' below the roofline of the carport. The new enclosure will match an existing full height front door gate in design and pattern. The proposed gate will slide on a floor mounted track to the right directly in front of the existing solid brick wall and will not attach to the main structure. The gate will only be open for vehicle entry/access and no existing landscaping or trees will be displaced.

Staff finds that enclosing the carport will not cause adverse effect to the home, that the proposed design is appropriate to the structure since it relates to the existing front door wrought iron gate, and that if removed in the future the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. Staff also finds that the design intent of this house is for it to be closed off from the street since it has no windows facing Lake St. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on these findings.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve as submitted.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**9. HDRC NO. 2012-259**

Applicant: Sylvia Garcia

Address: 214 Devine St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to rehabilitate the detached, rear-unit building on this property. Activities affecting the exterior of the building include:

1. Construct a 60-square foot addition to the front of the unit;
2. Restructure roof to include new front-facing gable at the addition;
3. Replace exterior vinyl-clad, wood panel siding;
4. Replace original wood windows with new aluminum, simulated divided-light windows;
5. Install new exterior door;
6. Reroof with new composition asphalt shingles; and
7. Repair foundation.

Staff finds that work was begun without a Certificate of Appropriates or any construction permits.

Staff finds that the main residential building on this property was constructed prior to 1924 (Sanborn) in the Folk Victorian style. Staff finds that the rear unit associated with this property was constructed circa 1940 (BCAD) in the minimal traditional style, and has achieved historic significance in its own right and should be preserved. Also, the rear unit, although located towards the rear property line, is highly visible from Devine Street. Staff also finds that front-facing additions are not appropriate for historic buildings, and that this addition will obstruct the original façade of the building. Staff finds that the proposed replacement materials, including the panel siding, windows, and front door are not appropriate for the construction period of the rear unit. Staff further finds that this building rests directly on the ground, and is in need of a new foundation in order to preserve the structure.

1-5. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. The proposed alterations and materials are not appropriate for the style and construction period of the rear-unit building.

6-7. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that color of new roofing materials be approved prior to installation.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with staff stipulation and with the additional stipulations 1) gable roof be replaced with shed roof that begins top of the existing structure 2) siding proposed be painted over 3) windows be framed in wood.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**10. HDRC NO. 2012-270**

Applicant: Maria Caracheo

Address: 515 Mason

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 34' x 30 ft' carport to the back of the property. The structure will be steel and the roofing material will be corrugated metal. The carport will be 11' 8" tall.

Staff finds that the proposed carport is very large and not in keeping with the historic nature of the property. Staff finds that the proposed carport alters the character of the rear yard of this house, creating a mostly paved and covered area rather than an open yard. Staff also finds that the proposed carport does not appear to be in compliance with existing side yard setback requirements (5' from the side property line). Staff also finds that because the proposed carport is quite tall, it creates a visual obstruction from Colita St. (the alley to the rear of the property) and from the neighboring properties. Staff finds, however, that the carport is not visible from Mason St., which is the larger street in front of the property.

Staff recommends approval of the proposed carport with the stipulation that the footprint be modified to comply with the 5' side yard setback requirement, including the distance the carport roof projects from the supporting structure and that the overall height of the carport be reduced to 9'.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to approve with staff's stipulation that the footprint be modified to comply with the 5' side yard setback requirement, including the distance the carport roof projects from the supporting structure and that the overall height of the carport be reduced to 9'.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**11. HDRC NO. 2012-269**

Applicant: Rudy P. Quesada

Address: 908 Burleson St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 6' tall commercial grade chain link fence on the rear property line. There is an existing chain link fence on the front and sides at the back of the property.

Staff finds that although currently there is a 6' fence at the rear of the property, chain link is not an appropriate replacement material for fences in historic districts. Staff recommends that the existing wood privacy fence be replaced in kind. If a more transparent fence is desired, then staff recommends a wrought iron fence or a wood post and wire fence that is more in keeping with other fences in the Dignowity Hill Historic District. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on these findings.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve with staff stipulations with a 4th alternative of a tubular steel fence provided staff reviews proposed fence.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**12. HDRC NO. 2012-278**

Applicant: Doyle T. Walsh

Address: 601 N. Alamo

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace 36 double-hung, one-over-one wood windows with new energy efficient Marvin double-hung, one-over-one, vinyl-clad wood windows with a recreated lug/lamb's tongue detail. Selected cladding color is a neutral beige; and
2. Repair existing wood trim and window surrounds

The applicant forms this request based on the need for thermal comfort for tenants as well as reduced maintenance for the existing windows.

One member of staff visited the site on September 21, 2012. At the time, it was noted that all windows were in need of significant repair, with many requiring all new rails, stiles, and panes. Staff finds that this is a multi-family residential building converted from a circa 1927 garage and tire shop. Staff finds that, due to the orientation of the building, the windows on the southeast and southwest facades receive full sun exposure, resulting in the intense weathering of the windows and trim. Staff recognizes that the applicant has repaired the windows on multiple occasions in the past, and now seeks a low maintenance solution. Staff finds that the selected window product is of high quality and is an in-kind replacement for the original double hung windows. The vinyl cladding simulates painted wood, and reduces the need for continued maintenance.

In accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for rehabilitation, staff finds that historic windows should be repaired with in-kind materials in lieu of full replacement. Window restoration preserves the historic fabric of the building and prevents landfill. However, staff finds that many of these windows require replacement of more than 50% of the original material to remain functional, and an in-kind replacement, such as the product requested by the applicant, is appropriate for these instances.

1. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that any repairable windows should be salvaged and reused. Additional documentation will be required by the applicant to determine the number and locations of repairable windows.

2. Staff recommends approval as submitted.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve the window installation with the stipulation that the windows have a wood trim around to match existing. All deteriorated windows may be replaced with the aluminum clad windows.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

#### **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

#### **13. HDRC NO. 2012-279**

Applicant: Jill Giles

Address: 412 E. Commerce

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing signage at the Riverbend Parking Garage and add additional signage at this location. The proposed signage includes:

1. Replacement of the existing "PARK" blade sign facing Commerce St. The proposed new "PARK" blade sign will be a total of 26' tall and extend 7'6" from the building. It will be a triple sided sign for a total of approximately 450 square feet of signage. The proposed design incorporates a red arrow pointing through the sign and toward the entrance of the garage. The arrow will include neon tube lighting.
2. Replacement of the existing "Enter" and "Exit" blade signs facing Commerce St. and Presa St., respectively. The proposed "Enter" and "Exit" signs will be triple sided and 24" wide by 45" tall, for a total of approximately 22 square feet of signage each, with downward facing arrows which will include neon tube lighting.

3. A horizontal blade sign facing Market St. which will extend 9' from the building face. The proposed new sign will be installed on the southeast corner of the garage and will replace an existing vertical blade sign on the southwest corner of the structure. The proposed sign will be double sided, consisting of a 9' wide by 2' tall band of letters and a 6.5' tall arrow at the far end of the sign, for a total of approximately 117 square feet of signage. The arrow will incorporate neon tube lighting.

4. New canopy signs for the existing ground level tenants facing Commerce St. The awning system pictured here as the framework for the proposed tenant signage is part of a project that received final approval from the HDRC on February 1, 2012, to introduce new materials at street level to enhance the pedestrian experience.

Staff finds that while the proposed new three sided blade sign facing Commerce St. is larger than the existing blade sign in that location (a proposed approximately 450 square feet, as opposed to the existing 420 square feet), the increase in the amount of signage at this location is minimal and overall the proposed signage does not increase the total amount of signage on the parking garage. Staff finds that the proposed horizontal blade sign facing Market St. represents a departure from the appearance and location of the existing vertical blade sign facing Market St., but that the proposed sign--approximately 116 square feet--is much smaller than the existing sign--approximately 420 square feet--that it will be replacing. Staff also finds that the proposed tenant awning signage is appropriately scaled to the location and, in conjunction with the previously approved street level alterations, will provide a more uniform street edge along this part of Commerce St.

1, 2 & 3. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on these findings.

4. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that each canopy mounted tenant sign be limited to 16 square feet.

This recommendation is consistent with the UDC Section 35-678 – Signs and Billboards in the RIO and with the License Agreement regarding Riverbend Parking Garage between the City of San Antonio and Hixon Properties Incorporated, signed November 24, 2008.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve Items 1 - 3 as submitted. Item 4 approved with the stipulation that each canopy mounted tenant sign be limited to 16 square feet.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

#### **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

#### **14. HDRC NO. 2012-280**

Applicant: Carlos Barajas, PE

Address: S. Alamo St. from Probandt St. to Pereida St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace existing storm drainage
2. Change the configuration of the street from 4 lanes to 3 lanes including a center turn lane to accommodate previously approved improvements and widening of the sidewalk on the south side of S. Alamo St. and re-install the curbline on the north side of the street according.
3. Construct a 1' to 3' curb with variable flatwork width adjacent to the street. The proposed flatwork will be textured concrete with a Used Brick Running Bond pattern. The color of the textured concrete will be aged concrete to match existing.
4. Replace ADA curb ramps at the intersections along the project limits. In locations where directional curb ramps exist, these will also be replaced with directional curb ramps to follow the path of the existing sidewalk. The color of the ramp landings for the truncated domes will be dark grey and the concrete will be aged to match existing.

1 & 2. Staff recommends approval as submitted

3. Staff finds that both the existing sidewalk and the green strip adjacent to the street are important elements of the

streetscape along S. Alamo and characteristic of both the King William Historic District and the Lavaca Historic District. Staff also finds that introducing a narrow paved strip adjacent to the street will create an unsafe condition for pedestrians in the area and that infilling the strip with grass instead of concrete would be a more appropriate solution. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on these findings.

4. Staff recommends approval as submitted with the stipulation that directional ramps are used when possible.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve with staff stipulations and additional stipulations 1) notification must be provided should trees have to be removed 2) archaeological monitoring during excavation.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

#### **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

#### **15. Historic Design Guidelines**

Applicant: Office of Historic Preservation

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting the adoption of the Historic Design Guidelines to the Unified Development Code, to supplement various articles of Chapter 35 of the UDC including Article III, Zoning; Article IV, Procedures; and Article VI, Historic Preservation and Urban Design, applicable to all properties within the historic zoning overlay. The Historic Design Guidelines could be viewable in their original format within the code or as a standalone document. The intent of the document is not to confuse or muddle the existing requirements, but to supplement and provide clarity to the Historic Preservation Code.

The Office of Historic Preservation (OHP) currently uses the Secretary of the Interior's (SOI) Standards for Rehabilitation as the primary set of guidelines for the review of historic properties. The SOI Standards are an encompassing set of ten standards that are applied to all historic properties but because they are only ten brief standards they are open to interpretation. Of the many recommendations included in the Strategic Historic Preservation Plan adopted City Council in 2009, establishing a set of historic design guidelines specific to San Antonio was a primary concern for the appropriate long-term development and adaptive reuse of our historic districts and landmarks. The lack of defined guidelines specific to San Antonio's historic properties leaves the door open for possible confusion and misinterpretation of the current standards. During the public input and stakeholder review process for the Strategic Historic Preservation Plan multiple citizens and economic development interests noted the need for predictability during the development and review process of historic properties. The establishment of more substantial, detailed design guidelines would allow for more predictability in the interpretation and implementation of the standards for our historic properties.

City Council approved the contracting of consultants Clarion Associates and Hardy Heck Moore, Inc. (Ordinance no. 2011-09-29-0807) on September 29, 2011. Before work began on the document, OHP staff met with a volunteer-led advisory committee and hosted a public meeting to collaborate on the content and format of the document. Within the year, the consultants have worked with OHP staff to produce the draft Historic Design Guidelines and Standards. Upon its public release on August 25th at the Historic Homeowner's Fair, the draft was made available for public comment through numerous outlets including advertisements, email notifications, and two public meetings. Comments were received through correspondence, at the public meetings, and via an online survey through September 19th. OHP staff has worked with the consultants to incorporate pertinent feedback into the final draft.

The Historic Design Guidelines are divided into eight (8) sections, and provide useful guidelines and standards that can be applied specifically to any project. The guidelines and standards illustrate and provide examples of existing UDC requirements, and provide supplement information based on common requests and recommendations. The adopted Historic Design Guidelines and Standards will provide historic district residents, property owners, professionals working with historic properties, and potential construction applicants a background history of the districts, an understanding of architectural design principles, and guidelines which will promote predictability and ensure compatibility between new development and the existing historic environment.



Staff finds that the draft was available for sufficient public input and that relevant comments were incorporated into the final document. These comments, along with the draft Guidelines, were presented before the advisory committee who was satisfied with the level of input. The advisory committee recommends approval of the Guidelines. Public comments and recommended revisions were presented to one member of the Design Review Committee on September 25, 2012. The Guidelines were well received and noted to be an excellent tool for applicants. The Guidelines were revised to include additional information regarding additional clarification of general procedures related to the design review process.

Staff recommends approval. The Historic Design Guidelines will provide for greater predictability, consistency and clarity in the design-review process.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Guarino for a recommendation for adoption to City Council with the stipulation that staff further develop the Site Elements chapter through consultation with local landscape professionals and SAWS.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:05 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone  
Chair